University of Zurich[UZH]

Zurich Open Repository and Archive
University of Zurich
University Library
Strickhofstrasse 39
CH-8057 Zurich
www.zora.uzh.ch

Year: 2017

Book Review of Celeste L. Arrington, Accidental Activists: Victim Movements and Government Accountability in Japan and South Korea

Chiavacci, David

Posted at the Zurich Open Repository and Archive, University of Zurich
ZORA URL: https://doi.org/10.5167/uzh-143781
Journal Article
Published Version

Originally published at:
Chiavacci, David (2017). Book Review of Celeste L. Arrington, Accidental Activists: Victim Movements and Government Accountability in Japan and South Korea. Pacific Affairs, 90(3):588-591.

prosperity. They were concerned about their politically active classmates shedding their beliefs and undergoing an "employment conversion" when they graduated and about how conformism was being enforced in the 1950s just as in the 1930s. Chapter 5 shows how this led to the group promoting an oppositional stance embodied in the ideal of a classless society.

The conclusion, finally, is about the Science of Thought group's struggle in connection with the protest movement against the US-Japan Security Treaty of 1960 and how they tried to transcend the political divide between progressives and conservatives and set an example of principled opposition to the government in the name of defending democracy. They countered the suggestion that a silent majority of the population supported the treaty.

The book is a historical exposé of the development of the Science of Thought and how the focus and philosophy of its members adjusted to changing conditions in the surrounding society. It tells the story of how difficult it must have been for the Japanese to embrace democracy right after the war and how some individuals, believing in a scientific approach, really struggled to have it implemented in Japanese society. It is a good illustration of the devotion that individual Japanese citizens can bring to bear once they are convinced of a certain idea. Japanese society is often described as one that favours consensus, but in this book we also gain insights into how fighting can go on inside organizations when members have different ideas—something which is not uncommon in civil society organizations in Japan today. It also testifies to the Japanese belief in "learning by doing." Rather than emphasizing the development of refined theories, the Science of Thought members believed that democracy needed to be practised if it were to gain ground.

This is an unusual book that does not follow any specific trends. It gives a broad picture of left-wing and opposition movements in Japanese society and the struggle to establish a culture of democracy. I would strongly recommend it to anyone who wants to gain insight into this type of democracy movement, on which we do not seem to have much research at the moment. The book is also a good read for anyone interested in philosophy in its broadest sense.

Stockholm School of Economics, Stockholm, Sweden MARIE SÖDERBERG

ACCIDENTAL ACTIVISTS: Victim Movements and Government Accountability in Japan and South Korea. ***Studies of the Weatherhead East Asian Institute, Columbia University. By Celeste L. Arrington.*** *Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2016. xiii, 234 pp. (Tables, figures.) US$39.95, cloth. ISBN 978-0-8014-5376-2.*

This is an excellent book. In her study on victim movements in Japan and South Korea, Celeste Arrington searches for an answer to the question of why

Copyright (c) Pacific Affairs. All rights reserved.
Delivered by Ingenta to: ? IP: 89.206.118.5 on: Tue, 16 Jan 2018 13:05:29

some victims and their supporters receive more redress and compensation from the state than others. Her well-thought-out and elaborate analysis delivers not only an innovative answer to this question, but she also contributes significantly to theory building by developing a dynamic and interactive model in her book. Her comparative study is carefully researched and is based on impressive fieldwork conducted in Japan and South Korea with over 200 interviews from 2007 to 2015, as well as written sources in both Japanese and Korean. Finally, it is well and clearly written, which makes it a pleasure to read.

Beyond the introduction and conclusion, the main part of the book is structured into five chapters. After explaining her research question and introducing her argument in the introduction, Arrington develops the theoretical framework in the first chapter by constructing a redress scale in order to capture the variation in redress outcome and she identifies different ideal types of sequence patterns in conflict expansion processes. In the second chapter, she discusses how victimhood and state accountability have been constructed over time in both Japan and South Korea. She also analyzes lawyers' autonomy vis-à-vis the state, structures, and grassroots embeddedness of civil society, as well as the diversity of the mainstream media. In the subsequent three empirical chapters, the author traces victim redress movements related to Hansen's disease, hepatitis C tainted blood products, and citizens abducted by North Korea in both Japan and South Korea. She discusses the interaction between these movements, mass media, and the state and shows how differences in these processes have led to great variation in the success of the movements in enacting official inquiries and institutional reforms as well as in the success of gaining an official apology and state compensation. While the Hansen's disease movement and the hepatitis C movements achieved full redress in Japan, the Hansen's disease movement in South Korea and the abductee movements in both countries gained only partial redress. Furthermore, the South Korean hepatitis C virus movement did not obtain any significant redress from the state. In the conclusion, the main argument is recapitulated and some further examples are introduced to demonstrate the validity of the theoretical model developed in the study.

The main contribution of this book is the new and dynamic model on the interaction between victim redress movements, which frames the victimization and politicians. This interactive model is an important step forward from the static theoretical models of state-society interaction that are still dominant in research on civil society and social movements. Arrington's main argument is that "gaining an elite ally too early in the claims-making process can be detrimental, even if outsider groups ultimately need elite allies to affect policy. … [It] reduces incentives to mobilize fellow claimants and sympathetic citizens, leaving these allies with less leverage" (4–5). Moreover, her book is also an important contribution to our understanding

Copyright (c) Pacific Affairs. All rights reserved.
Delivered by Ingenta to: ? IP: 89.206.118.5 on: Tue, 16 Jan 2018 13:05:29

of the state-society relationship in Japan and South Korea. In contrast to the state-of-the-art research on civil society in Japan and South Korea, and despite much more homogeneous mainstream media and weaker advocacy capabilities by civil society in Japan, her study shows that conditions in the public sphere for redress movements are more favourable, and that victim redress movements have achieved better outcomes in Japan than in South Korea.

Despite being an empirical and theoretically strong and compelling analysis, this reviewer also identifies some shortcomings in Arrington's study. To begin with, despite a very clear argument, it becomes unclear regarding how early is "too early." This is a fundamental problem of any dynamic theoretical models. Moreover, one starting point of Arrington's argument is that the transition to democracy in South Korea, as well as the end of uninterrupted rule of the Liberal Democratic Party (LDP) in Japan, resulted from the early 1990s onwards in more favuorable political conditions for outsider groups in both countries, which gave victim movements more collective leverage. While the end of authoritarian rule and democratization in South Korea surely fundamentally changed the political climate and institutions, I am not fully convinced that the same applies to Japan. As the author herself recognizes, victim redress movements related to the *burakumin* (an outcast group), as well as to Minamata disease, had already in earlier decades in Japan achieved favourable redress outcomes. The long (and nearly unique) stay in power of the LDP under a democratic system may in fact have much to do with its "creative conservatism" (T.J. Pempel), i.e., its flexibility in taking up new issues that made it to the public agenda, including the claims of victim movements. This also raises the question of whether the focus on politicians in the study is really reasonable, or if the role of state bureaucracies should not also have been incorporated in both countries. This would make the theoretical model much more complicated, but there is plenty of recent empirical evidence demonstrating that Japan and South Korea in many policy fields still exemplify strong states in which bureaucrats are not simple agents of politicians as their principals. Finally, as in nearly all comparative studies, one has to question if national political system differences have been adequately taken into account. For example, South Korea's president has, in general, more decision power and agenda-setting abilities than Japan's prime minister. This, and other differences, might have a significant influence on the political processes, but are not included in the model and analysis.

Still, as stated at the beginning, this is, without a doubt, an excellent book. The comments in the paragraph above should not be regarded as a critique, but more as an illustration of how stimulating Arrington's study is; one would like to immediately start a discussion with her. What more can we expect from an academic book? It can only be hoped that this book finds a large readership in the social sciences as well as in East Asian studies. The

Copyright (c) Pacific Affairs. All rights reserved.
Delivered by Ingenta to: ? IP: 89.206.118.5 on: Tue, 16 Jan 2018 13:05:29

future is unwritten, but it can be assumed with high probability that this book will have a significant impact on the research on victim movements and on Japanese and South Korean politics.

University of Zurich, Zurich, Switzerland DAVID CHIAVACCI

YASUKUNI SHRINE: History, Memory, and Japan's Unending Postwar. ***Studies of the Weatherhead East Asian Institute, Columbia University. By Akiko Takenaka.*** *Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2015. ix, 278 pp. (Illustrations.) US$57.00, cloth. ISBN 978-0-8248-4678-7.*

Copyright (c) Pacific Affairs. All rights reserved.
Delivered by Ingenta to: ? IP: 89.206.118.5 on: Tue, 16 Jan 2018 13:05:29

In present day East Asia, there are few issues as contentious as the past, and there are few places that are the subject of as much controversy as the Yasukuni Shrine in Tokyo. In this masterful and empirically rich study, Akiko Takenaka performs an invaluable service in providing an almost panoramic history of the origins of the Yasukuni Shrine and its evolution since its founding in 1869.

The book begins by tracing the origins of the shrine to medieval Japanese beliefs in the need to appease the spirits of the dead (*goryō shinkō*) by creating special shrines (*Shōkonsha*) and conducting placatory rituals. Originally created to commemorate the spirits of the soldiers who fell in the Boshin War at the start of the Meiji Restoration, Yasukuni quickly became a central site where the Japanese state sought to shape the official historical narrative and instill the spirit of patriotic sacrifice in the broader citizenry. Takenaka calls this exercise in transcendental authoritarianism "mobilizing death" in the service of the state.

The Shrine also became one of Tokyo's main entertainment districts, replete with shops, curio shows, and regular festivals and horse races on temple grounds. Later, these more traditional forms of diversion were expanded with the construction of a war museum that included full-scale battlefield dioramas that allowed eager visitors to vicariously experience the thrill of the Empire's victories overseas. In this way, emotions of joy and excitement, as well as grief and sorrow, were molded by the state to serve national interests.

Takenaka gives an informative description of how after 1945 the Shrine continued to work closely with the government in the postwar era even after it became a privately run entity. She chronicles how, together with the Ministry of Health and Welfare, as well as the immensely influential Japan Association for the Bereaved Families of the War Dead (the *Nihon Izokukai*), the Shrine officials continued to draw up lists of who would be commemorated at the shrine and who would not. In the process, the Shrine became the center of a complex battle over how to remember modern Japanese history. In one of the most interesting sections of the book, Takenaka argues that